Impact Assessment Report

Project Pragaash

Implemented by HELP Foundation, J&K

Implemented at Kupwara, Jammu & Kashmir

ASSESSMENT BY

Dr. Mousumi Mondal

[Submitted to funding Agency: Sir Dorabjee Tata Trust (SDTT) Submitted by HELP (Human Effort for Love and Peace) Foundation]

December 2011
Executive Summary

Objective: Final Impact Assessment of a developmental project Pragaash initiated in 2008 in Lolab valley of Kupwara district in Jammu and Kashmir

Goals: The specific goals of the Project Pragaash were following

I. Provide quality education to children of ten villages of the most backward district, Kupwara of Jammu & Kashmir up to 10th class with special emphasis to orphans, girls and physically challenged.

II. Empower young women especially drop-out youth, destitute women and widows in the valley economically through different livelihood support (vocational training and one time financial support)

III. Promote the use of computers for bridging the digital divide and also eventually facilitate the use of computers for receiving on-line education.

Major Findings: Khumriyal and nine target villages within Lolab valley of Kupwara is economically quite poor with significant number of families depending on financial support from well to do relatives or religious organization. While there are around twenty-five government schools with primary and middle wings and similar number of private schools, quality education and fees are major constraints for many families having 3-4 children at school going age, Pragaash’s effort to fully support 250 orphans, and provide education to another 450 children of middle income families in Shah Anwar Memorial School (SAMS) is a bold step towards empowering young generation of this backward villages of the Kupwara district.

Computer has been included as a mandatory subject in the school from 1st grade and students are not being charged any extra fee for it unlike a practice prevalent in other schools of the valley. It has been providing basic knowledge on Information Technology
Impact Assessment Report – Project PRAGAASH 2011

(IT) and has also emerged as a source of entertainment for teenagers. Besides giving training to school children, this center has also imparting basic computer training to villagers on a professional basis and more than twenty two trainees of the center have been appeared for Certificate Course of Computer Concept (CCC) of DOEACC.

The objective to enable young women to set up gainful ventures for independent livelihood has been initiated successfully in the Vocational Training Center (VTC) at the SAM school. Though none of the trainee has opened their own center yet, 25% of them are earning some money by making suits and Salwars of their neighbors and for the school children in the VTC facility. Couple of the girls have managed getting second hand sewing machine at home and have been training their sisters while stitching frocksuits and household stuff for their family and saving the fee which otherwise would have been given to outsider tailors. The effort at VTC has directly benefitted more than hundred young ladies in the Lolab valley by imparting vocational skills, enhancing their confidence, and giving a space for their entertainment. In long run, this will help these women coping with financial hardship and indirectly strengthen their family and hence society.

Project has provided more than thirty families of special children with livestock (goats, sheep and cow) as one time financial support and has made them (women of the family) knowledgeable about the additional source of income through livestock breeding. Fifty percent of the family didn’t see any obvious benefit from this initiative, while, rest of the beneficiaries consider this as their future asset. Most of these women are aware about different financial schemes of Govt. and Kashmir Women’s Credit Cooperation Society for destitute women to help them establishing small setup for their self employment. However, none of them availed anything yet.

Methodology: Structured interviews were held with the direct beneficiaries (students and teachers) of the Shah Anwar Memorial School, young women, and widows and destitute of ten villages getting support from livelihood program and informal discussion were done with staff of the school and HELP foundation and the families of direct
beneficiaries. The data on ten villages were obtained from Social Welfare Dept of the Kupwara district.

**Projects Evaluated and Results:**
The effectiveness of different initiatives under *Pragaash* project was;

1) SAMS (76%; B)  
2) Livelihood Support: Vocational Training Center (81%; A) and Livestock Support (56%; C)  
3) Computer Education (70%; B)

**Recommendations:** Some suggestions have been put forward so that it could be incorporated in next phase of project.

1) Benchmarking admission criteria for special students
2) Need of consistent monitoring of student progress
3) Support for an additional bus
4) One time fellowship for few promising beneficiaries from VTC to kick start their own business in their villages
5) Discontinuation of Livestock support project
6) Emphasis on proper documentation and improved monitoring of all the project activities
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. INTRODUCTION .......................................................... 1

II. METHODOLOGY .......................................................... 2

III. SURVEY RESULTS ....................................................... 3
    A. Shah Anwar Memorial School ..................................... 3
    B. Beneficiaries under Livelihood Support ......................... 4
    C. Indirect Beneficiaries of ten villages ......................... 7

IV. FINAL IMPACT ASSESSMENT ............................................. 8

V. RECOMMENDATIONS ................................................... 13

VI. CASE STUDIES .......................................................... 15

VII. APPENDIX .............................................................. 20
INTRODUCTION:

This Impact assessment report makes a comparative statement between the objectives set to achieve in Khumriyal and its neighboring villages under Lolab valley in Kupwara district of Jammu and Kashmir and the achieved success / constraints faced by Pragaash or developments of this project till date. This report mainly does a qualitative judgment rather than focusing only on quantitative aspects for the purpose of evaluation. The consultant (Surveyor) believes that quantitative framework alone would be insufficient to measure the effectiveness of this program. It needs to be emphasized here that the main aim of conducting this assessment is to indicate the extent of project success, its probable outcome in the long term and to recommend certain actions/ activities which might be implemented in the second phase of project.

The project Pragaash was started in November 2008 and has completed three years in October 2011. A final Impact assessment is due in February 2012 to measure the performance/ outcomes of project. Prior to this, a base line study was conducted at the start of the program and then six mid-term progress reports were submitted to the funding agency for project progress monitoring purpose. This report uses recommendations/ findings of earlier studies, to a little extent, as part of final evaluation parameter.

The target area of the project revolves around Khumriyal and other nine villages located in Lolab valley of frontier district Kupwara. Kupwara is one of the most backward districts of the state of Jammu and Kashmir; Illiteracy and poverty already prevailing in this district (located along the Line of Actual Control with Pakistan Administered Kashmir) have been compounded by the ongoing armed conflict and cross border terrorism, more than last two decades. Project Pragaash was initiated by HELP Foundation in 2008 to empower operational area socially, educationally & economically. The school (Shah Anwar Memorial Secondary School), which is the focal activity of the project Pragaash, provides quality education to children of this mostly backward district. The project is focusing on orphans/underprivileged children, with preference to girl students and dropouts for receiving formal & informal education so that they do not get
excluded from the educational system. In order to carry forward the project, there are integrated activity like V.T.C, Computer centre, Library and Livelihood support vis-à-vis the economic engagements for the community in general and for the orphan/underprivileged families in particular.

**METHODOLOGY:**

The tools used for data collection by this surveyor were mainly structured interviews and informal talks with the beneficiaries of the school, VTC and target villagers.

Surveyor visited the school (SAMS) for five days, interviewed teachers and students (both regular and special) of the school, observed the practices starting from assembly, classes, lunch break till closing of school time.

During this time surveyor personally visited cutting and tailoring unit and craft unit of VTC and computer facility based in SAMS, talked to the trainee and their teachers.

As part of the livelihood project evaluation surveyor made personal visits to 80% of the beneficiary houses in nine of the ten villages, and formal-informal talk conversation was done with the direct beneficiaries and their family members. Surveyor also got glimpse of the livestock’s they are taking care at their houses.

The questionnaire used for formal interview has been provided at the appendix and rest of the informal interviews revolved around the issues of education, financial hardship and their expectation from the school.

Informal talks were also done with staff of SAMS and employee of HELP foundation to understand their work culture and views about this project.
**SURVEY RESULTS:**

**Shah Anwar Memorial School:** The school (Shah Anwar Memorial Secondary School) which is the focal point of the project Pragaash is providing quality education to children of ten villages of the most backward district of J & K up to 10th class with special emphasis to orphans, girls and disabled.

Since the inception of the project in 2008, intake capacity of the school has almost been doubled. In this current academic year, total 682 students have been enrolled. So far, Pragaash has fully supported education of total 251 orphans of ten villages of Kupwara district in this school. The support covers tuition fee and expenditure related to book, stationeries, and uniform (including sweater and shoes). Out of 251 orphans, there are 113 girls and 138 boys including 4 physically challenged teenagers. This definitely reflects project’s commitment to include girls’ from underprivileged sector into the mainstream education.

Two buses bought under this project were quintessential for the daily commute of these children from the far-flung areas of the villages. At present 187 students are getting bus facility, out of which 89 are girls. Without this bus facility it would have been just impossible for these students to commute a distance of average 15 km up down each day.

To accommodate extra student and providing them quality education, school has recruited additional teachers who are well qualified in teaching and subject matters. Currently, there are thirty teachers in the school of which eight teachers (six regular, one craft master, one tailor master, and one computer teacher) are directly benefitted from this project funding. In the past four years more than six capacity building workshops (in the area of traditional and novel teaching methodology, writing skill, creativity unlocking) have been organized for the teachers with help of experts from state education dept, and NGOs from outside the state. The trainings they have received are being practiced in the class. The novel approach to teach children through painting, writing, photography, and collage has a big impact among teachers as they have been sharing this experience with the teachers of other schools. Moreover, students are thrilled
to explore their hidden skills in painting, thinking, debating, writing and photo shooting. Teachers are maintaining the record of lesson plans to keep track of their syllabus and self-evaluation. Teachers have also realized the importance of having a portfolio of students (especially the special children) for monitoring each child’s progress down the lane.

Besides getting education in traditional subjects, students of SAMS have also been exposed to training in extra-curricular skills such as theatre and debates and been counseled by clinical psychologist for their holistic up-liftmen. With the support from SDTT and HELP foundation, students of this school have built up their confidence as reflected by their active participation in different cultural program such as sports, drama, celebration of teachers’ day and environment day. The overall performance of students in final exam is quite satisfactory in lower primary class, satisfactory in middle std. and commendable in higher classes. The students who sit in board exams (10th std.) from this school since 2008 have secured 100% success in the examination including distinctions. SAM school stood among the top three schools in the Kupwara district having 100% result achievements.

**Beneficiaries under livelihood support:**

**Vocational Training:**

Since the inception of Pragaash, sixty (60) girls have been trained in Cutting and Tailoring Center and have learned making Kurta- Shalwar, Afghani Dress, Pheran, Pant shirts, Pillow covers and Bed Sheets. Moreover, this center is making all the uniforms of the students of the SAMS and trainee girls have been paid for their contribution. This year total Rs. 40,000 has been paid to nine trainees for stitching school uniforms. In recent years, these girls are being engaged in cotton bag making to overcome the shortage of packing material as a result of ban on polythene. This bag making with
marketing in place has developed an interest and good economic avenues for these girls. Another sixty (60) girls are getting training in the sozni, ari work (Kashmiri embroidery) in the craft center established as VTC in the SAMS. In most cases the VTC acts as the training cum production center and also allows the products to be sold so as to generate its own funds for long-term sustainability.

Trainees at VTC are aged 15-25 and ninety percent of them discontinued their study after middle-high school due to financial hardship in the family and hence engaged in household activity. Majority of such families of survive with a monthly income of less than Rs. 5000 with an average family member of seven. These trainees are continuously being motivated to rejoin the educational system. In last year, a big success was achieved as one dropout orphan girl from the craft center passed her Higher Secondary Part II exams after a gap of three years and joined the College for higher studies (all the expenses were met by the HELP Foundation).

Before coming to the VTC at SAMS, none of these trainees ever did any cutting, stitching or crafting in their life. 80% of the trainee has participated in the motivations cum Registration camps organized by HELP foundation in collaboration with the District Handicrafts Office Kupwara and Kashmir Women’s Credit Cooperative Society/ Bank Limited and are aware of different scheme available to destitute ladies. Majority of them have opened account in KWCCCL, however, haven’t accessed any loan so far. The concern is the uncertainty of their success in the new venture and hence worried for their capacity to return the loan in future.

**Livelihood Program:**

As a part of the project activities, in past four years total sixty two livestock (goats/sheep/cow) were distributed among the identified women beneficiaries preferably widows whose children are in SAMS or destitute women from the Khumriyal and nine other operational villages.

Surveyor has personally visited 24 households out of 31 beneficiaries under livelihood
support program in nine villages. There were nine goat beneficiaries, and 90% of them didn’t see any benefit from these; most of the cases goats were died within a year or so. While couple of family benefitted from goat milk for few months (consumed in their house), one family received Rs. 4000 by selling two calves in Kashta-Khumriyal area.

Out of 14 sheep beneficiaries, all the sheep from two beneficiary families were died while grazing. Sheep in rest twelve families have given birth to calves, and most of them are doing well. These families (85%) are happy with their livestock’ and want to consider them as their financial asset. Three of these families have sold at least one sheep and received average Rs. 4500. The distribution of feed and veterinary check up at the beginning had definitely boosted the interest of the family to consider taking these livestock as their livelihood support at the very first place.

Most of these beneficiaries were aware of loans under Govt. scheme from the workshop/awareness camps organized by the foundation. However, lack of any consistent income make them skeptical about the possibility of return of the loan and hence, 80% of the interviewee is hesitant to take any loan in near future. Around thirty percent of the livelihood beneficiaries interviewed have applied for the cattle loan and would prefer to have cattle instead of sheep/goat. Since grazing of cattle is easier and there is potential of money from selling the milk products, foundation might consider this aspect in its future plan.Moreover, there is concern over the delay of the loans and beneficiaries are not proactive to follow this up.

Secondary information was collected on the single cow beneficiary under this project. The beneficiary was a blind woman with a family of her blind husband, two blind daughters and a son of visual impairment. The cow they received in 2009 had given birth to a calf selling which fetch them Rs. 24,000. Currently, there are two more calves, worth of Rs 40,000, in the house. In a family, surviving on the financial support from the neighbors and village development committee, this is a significant source of comfort. Moreover, the money coming from selling the milk in the neighborhood has also been utilized in her son’s education.
Computer Literacy:

With the funding from SDTT project Pragaash, SAMS has introduced the computer literacy among the youth of Khumriyal and surrounding villages. With a trained teacher and eight computers supported by a generator the center has been providing theory and practical training to all the students in the school. Besides, this center has also been imparting basic IT literacy training to the people of these villages with a nominal monthly fee of Rs. 200. The computer center has so far trained around fifty youth (both boys and girls having +10 knowledge) from Khumriyal and neighboring villages. Most of these trainees have appeared in the Certificate Course of Computer Concept (CCC) accredited by DOEACC and more than twenty two (22) trainee have qualified and received the certificate of CCC. This is the only center in the whole Lolab valley where anybody interested can get training in basic computer operation. Since state government has been opening Community Information Centers (CIC) at Block and Panchayat level, people exposed to computer education will be able to use it for their own benefit and will be helping others to utilize the CIC more prudently. Moreover, for students of the school it is not just another subject, this class has emerged as a source of entertainment and students are becoming familiar about the various benefits they can avail online.

Indirect Beneficiaries of ten villages:

Since the Pragaash started, HELP foundation in collaboration with Zonal Education Office has organized four refresher courses at Khumriyal for the teachers of the nine private and government schools of the Education Zone Khumriyal. The aim of the training was to create awareness among the teachers about the changes/ trends in the modern education system. The training was imparted to inmates by the trained resource persons provided by the Zonal Education Office, Khumriyal. Moreover, SAMS teachers
are also sharing their experience of teaching kids through creative writing with their folks from other school.

According to national education statistic during 2008-2009, literacy rate of district Kupwara was lowest in the state (43.2%) with male literacy rate of 56.1% and female literacy rate of 28.7%. It is quite encouraging to see that in 2011 Census, Kupwara ranked 11th in literacy (66.92 % literacy rate) out of 22 district of the state while Srinagar ranked 6th (71.2%). Moreover, the gap of literacy between male (77%) and female (54.8%) has also been shrinking. Surveyor was unable to avail exclusive data for Khumriyal and its neighboring 10 villages. Since Lolab is one of the major parts of Kupwara, it is expected that the trend would be similar in this region too and Pragaash has obviously contributed in such momentum.

**Final Impact Assessment:**

Final impact assessment of this community empowerment project, called Pragaash, has been done. In order to assess the performance/ impact/ outreach of various schemes, the surveyor has used the grading system like A (81-100%), B (61-80%), C (41-60%), D (21-40%), E (0-20%). The evaluation has been done on making a comparison between achieved objectives against the set objectives outlined in Project Proposal along with some feasible recommendations from Base line Survey and Mid-Term Impact Assessment report. The assigned weights written against achieved results/ failures in the templates are according to the importance of that activity ascertained by the surveyor.

**Objective 1:** Provide quality education to children of ten villages of the most backward district of J & K up to 10th class with special emphasis to orphans, girls and physically challenged

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activities</th>
<th>Achieved Results/ Failures</th>
<th>Criteria of Measurement</th>
<th>Grade</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Assigned Weight</td>
<td>Effectiveness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Increased enrolment of students from</td>
<td>Total number of students have increased from to 682 since the Pragaash started</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Impact Assessment Report – Project PRAGAASH 2011

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Aspect</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Score 1</th>
<th>Score 2</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10 villages</td>
<td></td>
<td>15</td>
<td>12</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enrolment of orphans in school</td>
<td>Total 251 orphans have been enrolled since 2008</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender Balance</td>
<td>Total: Boys 409 Vs 273 In special category: Boys 138 Vs Girls 113</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>14</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Free tuition, distribution of free books,</td>
<td>All the special children has received</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>uniforms to orphans</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transportation facility</td>
<td>2 buses have been bought and drivers have been recruited Buses are running in shift for commute of 187 students</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Library set up</td>
<td>One librarian and books in place</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recruitment of teacher</td>
<td>Five additional teachers have been recruited to address the growing number of students</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>7</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Capacity Building of teachers</td>
<td>8 training- workshops have been conducted as opposed to proposed 16</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strengthening students extracurricular</td>
<td>Workshop/classes on drama, painting, writing has been organized and students participated in cultural programs like teachers day, environment day, sports etc</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>7</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>skills</td>
<td>Though annual reports are there, no organized monitoring of special children’s progress was noted</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Total:** 100 76 B
### Objective 2: Empower young women especially drop-out youth, destitute women and widows in the valley economically through different livelihood support (vocational training and one time financial support)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activities</th>
<th>Achieved Results/ Failures</th>
<th>Criteria of Measurement</th>
<th>Grade</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Livelihood Support</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VTC</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Facility setup-raw materials</td>
<td>Two spacious room with sewing machines, and other raw materials</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Recruiting teachers</td>
<td>Timely Recruitment of two competent teachers: Tailor master and craft master</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Enrolment of students from 10 villages</td>
<td>120 trainees have been enrolled in the VTC</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Motivation/Awareness building</td>
<td>In last four years two awareness Camp on different financial schemes have been organized All participants are aware about different schemes, however, only 25% has applied for loan</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Progress Monitoring/evaluation</td>
<td>No proper documentation of the status of trainees</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>100</strong></td>
<td><strong>81</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Livestock Support</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Distribution of Livestock</td>
<td>Livestock has been distributed to 31 families while proposed number was 40</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Activity</td>
<td>Description</td>
<td>Impact</td>
<td>Satisfactory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health check-up/orientation course</td>
<td>4-5 check up- workshops have been conducted as opposed to proposed 16</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Feed distribution</td>
<td>Happened initially and no follow up there after</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Awareness Camp</td>
<td>In last four years two awareness Camp on different financial schemes have been organized. All participants are aware about different schemes, however, only 25% has applied for loan.</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monitoring</td>
<td>No up to date documentation of the status of the project</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>100</strong></td>
<td><strong>56</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**Objective 3:** Promote the use of computers for bridging the digital divide and also eventually facilitate the use of computers for receiving on-line education.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activities</th>
<th>Achieved Results/ Failures</th>
<th>Criteria of Measurement</th>
<th>Grade</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Facility setup-procurement of computers</td>
<td>Eight computers and one power back up installed in a spacious room</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Recruiting teachers</td>
<td>One teacher has been recruited</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Enrolment of students from 10 villages</td>
<td>Since 2008, only 47 students from the villages have been enrolled</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Participation of students of SAMS</td>
<td>Mandatory participation by all the students from grade 1 -10 and 95% of them enjoy it</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Motivation/Awareness building</td>
<td>No aggressive campaign</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Progress Monitoring/evaluation</td>
<td>No proper documentation of the status of trainees</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>100</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
RECOMMENDATIONS:

Activities carried out under project Pragaash has directly and indirectly impacted more than 1000 families of the Lolab valley. However, some of the broad suggestions as per findings and impact studies of the surveyor are being mentioned in the following paragraph. The main objective of this section is to recommend certain activities/programs or suggest some alternatives to improve upon existing programs.

SAMS is getting significant admission request from the villagers due to its quality education and financial support towards orphans. However, to maintain the quality of the education, emphasis should be given to benchmark the admission criteria for special students and to monitor the progress of admitted students rigorously.

As the student enrollment from far-flung regions is increasing, at least two additional buses are been recommended.

Surveyor has found out that there are some trainees in the VTC who are quite capable and enthusiastic to start their own business set up in their respective villages. However, due to financial uncertainty they are reluctant to take any loans. Through one time scholarship, two three capable VTC trainee could be supported to open their own tailoring/crafting center. They could be the role models for rest of the trainee in the center and in their community.

Computer center should be more pro active regarding their outreach and quality training.

Livestock support program at its current stage is not self sustainable and has mostly reflected the passive role of beneficiaries in the villages. The beneficiaries should not be just at the receiving end, the foundation should consider developing strategy where beneficiary should be responsible to carry forward the effort initiated by foundation more pro actively.

Proper documentation and regular monitoring of all the project activities should be enforced without further delay.

Overall, evaluation recommends that Pragaash should be continued for few more years to capitalize on the foundation that has been developed during the present project intervention. This will enable the people of Lolab valley to emerge as a community with educational and economic empowerment.
Case Studies

*A teacher’s story:*

**Rubina** started her career as a teacher in SAMS in 2007 with a paltry salary of Rs. 3500. In a family of eight members with monthly income of around Rs. 25,000 and significant educational expenses of her only brother (doing Engineering) and three sisters (doing MBBS and post graduation) it is a big financial challenge. Moreover, she has to commute two hours up and down with average monthly expenses of around Rs. 2000.

When the project Pragaash started in 2008, she was the first teacher who was benefitted from the funding through a moderate increase of her salary to Rs. 5000. The little extra she started getting from her job allowed her to bear the fee of post graduation and B. Ed course that she nurtured for past few years. After successfully finishing the two courses in 2010 through distance learning, she has just started her M. Ed and she is really grateful to her school administrators for supporting her through channeling the funding coming from SDTT.

**SAMS is the only school in the Lolab valley that provides free tuition, uniform, books and warm clothes to the orphans and to those kids whose parents simply can’t provide education to their children because of financial constraint. SAMS is the only school in the area that is giving free bus services to its students who otherwise have real difficulty to commute from far off villages. We have seen real difference in students’ attendance after introducing the bus services in school. And all these have been possible from the grant coming from SDTT since last four years:** Rubina emphasized without any hesitation.
She has attended all the capacity building workshops organized by HELP foundation in the school through SDTT funding. She is overwhelmed by the uniqueness of the creative learning workshop and brainstorming workshop. After experiencing the fun and power of learning through these non-traditional techniques, she has made a habit to use these methods in her classes. The success and impact of organizing such workshops is echoed in her own words as following: *I see the enthusiasm among students while using these techniques. I even would love to introduce these techniques to the teachers of other schools.*

In her own career in SAMS, Rubina has got the opportunity to deal with the orphans and understand the shadows and strength of their lives while teaching them with sincere compassion. *This is a bliss I experienced here and project Pragaash has made it possible through generous support from SDTT.*

**Note from a Special Child – Insha’s confession:**

*Insha Jan – Orphan studying at SAM School, Kupwara.*

Insha praised a lot about her teachers in SAMS. While she likes Urdu most in her syllabus, she wants to improve her English and Hindi languages, too. However, the significant impact of Insha being in this school could be reflected from her words as following: *since joining this school I am so much aware of importance of keeping my surroundings clean and I learned the ‘adab’ in this school only. In my previous school I used to listen gali around me.*
Note from a VTC Beneficiary – Rubina’s confession:

I got my identity in my village (Kashta) after joining VTC at the SAMS, Khumriayl.

Before joining the VTC, sixteen year old Rubina knew nothing about tailoring. Nevertheless, after spending more than six months in the VTC, she is confidently contributing her newly acquired skills in stitching uniform and “Pheran” for the students of the school.

There are around ten to fifteen girls of my age in our village. Currently, I am the only one skilled in tailoring in the village and would like to set up a tailoring store in my village to provide service to the villagers. In my store, other girls will also be trained and will be benefitted in coming years.
Bus used at SAM, School for pick up and drop off of special (orphans and physically challenged) children, funded by Sir Dorabji TATA Trust under project “Pragaash”.
Three smiling faces of Shah Anwar Memorial Secondary School, Kupwara, enjoy lunch time under shades of pine.

Mukhtaa Begam- Guardian of an orphan, rearing sheep (livelihood support) given to her under project “Pragaash” funded by SDTT.
Three, uniformly dressed, **Special Girls** at Shah Anwar Memorial secondary School, Khumriyal, Kupwara

Bashir Ahmad-Craft instructor at “Pragaash” VT Centre, Khumriyal, Kupwara
Appendix

A) Questionnaire for teachers (regular teacher and trainers at Vocational Training Center: Computer Center, Craft Center, and Cutting and Tailoring) at Shah Anwar Memorial School

1. Beneficiary name
2. Place of residence (own house/rented)
3. No of family members
4. Education levels of each member
5. Do you have enough food every day?
6. Source of drinking water
7. Energy source of cooking
8. Electrical appliances/ Vehicle/Land/ Livestock
9. Mode of transportation to school
10. Year of joining to the school
11. Year of inclusion into Project Pragaash
12. Beneficiary’s monthly salary before and after inclusion into this project
13. Employment status of family members
14. Monthly income of the family and source
15. Total no of schools (Govt. – Private) and VTC in the neighboring area
16. Major attributes that make difference between them and SAMS
   a. Do they enroll orphans?
   b. Do they enroll disabled?
   c. Do they take tuition fee? Do they provide uniforms and books and stationeries free?
   d. What is the average qualification of the teachers in those schools?
17. Yearly roll out of students from the beginning of the project?
18. Attentiveness of students towards regular lessons and co-curricular activities? (boys vs girls); (regular vs orphan); disabled

19. Attendance in the classes

20. How do they rate the bus service? Impact of bus on students’ attendance?

21. Impact of book, Stationary, dress distribution on students’ interest to study?

22. What is the duration of the training at VTCs? Is there any tuition fee for the non SAMS trainees?

23. How enthusiastic are these trainees and what do they do after the course?

24. Change in their life style? (spending time at the center vs no job)

25. Capacity building workshop for teachers:

26. Did they attend different training program organized under project Pragaash? How helpful are such trainings?

27. Are they practicing the techniques/methods (such as painting, creative writing, photography, collage etc) learned in such training
   a. If yes, do they see any change in their teaching outcome (students more attentive/enthusiastic/less time required to prepare the class etc.)
   b. If not, why?

28. How do they feel about the success of this project? (Change in their attitude/life style)

29. Are there specific recommendations and practices that could strengthen this project in future?
B) Questionnaire for students (direct beneficiary-orphans and destitute) at Shah Anwar Memorial School

1. Beneficiary name
2. Place of residence (own house/rented)
3. No of family members
4. Education levels of siblings
5. Source of family income
6. Do you have enough food every day?
7. Mode of transportation to school
8. Year of joining to this school
9. Name of previous school (if any)
10. Does s/he is any difference between SAMs and the her/his previous school
   a. Care and Teaching methodology of the teachers
   b. Do they take tuition fee?
   c. Do they provide meal in the school?
   d. Do they provide free uniforms and books and stationeries?
   e. School bus facility?
11. Do they come regularly to the school?
12. Is there hurdle in coming to the school?
13. Do they avail the bus service? How is it helping in particular?
14. Which classes do they like most?
15. Grade in recent exam?
16. Has s/he been participated in the training (painting/theatre/creative writing, etc) organized by school?
17. Is there any such co-curricular activity in the school? If not, will they like such to be included into the curriculum?
18. Does s/he get any help at home in preparing her/his lessons?

19. Does their family encourage them in coming to the school?

20. Do they have to contribute into their household work?

21. What do they want more from the school authority?

C) Questionnaire for Livelihood Beneficiaries

1. Beneficiary name

2. Place of residence (own house/rented)

3. No of family members

4. Education levels of family members

5. Amount of monthly family income and source

6. Do you have enough food every day?

7. Do they have livestock before in the house?

8. If yes:

   Problem faced due to disease of those animals?
   Were they vaccinating the animals?
   Was there any veterinary check up facility they were availing previously?

9. If no, were they knowledgeable about handling the livestock?

10. Which livestock did they get under this project?

11. What did they do with the received livestock?

12. Did they receive any training from anywhere?

13. If so, what did they learn and how are they implementing those in their livestock care? (Vaccination of animals/ regular checkup?

14. Do they buy feed for the animals?
15. Did they receive feed from the foundation?

16. Do they take animals for regular checkup and do they see any benefit from it?

17. Will they go to the animal husbandry dept in future when the HELP foundation stopped its support?

18. Do you see any difference in your life style (monthly income/ health benefit) after raising the livestock?

19. Are they aware of different trade and occupations related to small enterprises?

20. Are they aware of different financial schemes provided by Govt. for underprivileged people? From where do they know?

21. How clear and confident they are about the schemes (such as KWCC etc)?

22. If yes, did they avail any and which one?

23. How and whom did they approach?

24. How the loan has been utilized and the outcome?